



San Francisco Bay Chapter

Serving Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin and San Francisco Counties

REPLY TO:

802 Balra Drive
El Cerrito, CA 94530

Telephone: (Cell) 510-295-7657

Email: n.laforce@comcast.net

September 19, 2017

Mayor Trish Spencer and Members of
the Alameda City Council

Re: Encinal Terminals Project

Dear Mayor Spencer and City Council Members:

The Sierra Club maintains that in any proposed public land exchanges the purpose should be to promote the protection and restoration of biological and ecological values.

We oppose the state tidelands property exchange in the Encinal Terminals Project Master Plan and do not support the plan at this time for the following reasons:

- **Bad deal for California** – The tidelands exchange would give up most of the existing tidelands in exchange for land and water around the perimeter of the site that is already protected by the San Francisco Bay Plan. It also creates a narrow strip of tidelands trust land through the center of the project that serves only to benefit the new neighborhood.
- **Contrary to California Public Trust Doctrine** – The benefits of the project, which would be facilitated by the tidelands exchange, are primarily municipal in nature: New housing and completion of a city street. Neither of these benefits are public trust allowable uses. Public trust land is held in trust for all of the people of California, not local municipalities.

- **Undermines climate action potential** – The tidelands exchange fails to appreciate the value of living shorelines to mitigate extreme climate events and offset the loss of marshland habitat as sea level rises. The proposed land exchange dices up the existing parcel making it unusable for creating marshland.
- **Creates an encumbrance on state tidelands** – The Master Plan seeks the right to build sea walls on part of the new proposed tidelands as a future sea level rise mitigation measure for protection of this residential development.

The Sierra Club opposes the project with the tidelands exchange. Once it is removed from the project, the Sierra Club will evaluate the project without that component to determine whether it can support a revised project. The Sierra Club urges you to pursue a different vision for the site that incorporates a naturally resilient adaptation of our shoreline to rising sea level.

Sincerely yours,

Norman La Force

Norman La Force, Chair
East Bay Public Lands Committee